Student Success in the First College Year: The Promise of High Quality High Impact Practices

George D. Kuh

Focusing on the First Year

The Ohio State University

February 16, 2016
Student Success

Insuring that America and its citizens thrive in the global future requires a postsecondary education that results in high levels of learning and personal development for ALL students.
The **OSU** First College Year

FYE is committed to creating the conditions for success for all new students. Through diverse and relevant programs and meaningful relationships, new students will better understand how to navigate the changing world around them, enhance their capacity to engage with new people and ideas, and develop the skills and connections required to meet the challenges they face…
Ponder This

What do students need to know and do to succeed at OSU and afterwards?

What programs and practices are you currently using that are promising?

What more do you need to know and do to be more effective in your work with students?

What obstacles need to be addressed and what resources are needed to help more of your students finish what they start?
The Major Tasks

Teach students to:

- **Reflect** – think about their thinking and experiences in and out of the classroom, on and off the campus

- **Apply** – transfer and use what one has learned in different settings that present novel challenges and opportunities

- **Integrate** – connect and grasp the relevance of what they are learning from different courses, out-of-class experiences, and life beyond the institution
Overview

- What the world needs now
- HIPs: What they are and why high quality implementation matters to student success in the first college year
- Recommendations
True or false?

Ohio State graduates will have 10-14 jobs in their career.

*False* They will have 10-14 jobs *by age 38!*

DOL-BLS
Today’s U.S. Workforce

What percent of the entire labor force changes jobs ANNUALLY?
(a) 9% (b) 15% (c) 21%
(d) 27% (e) 33%

e. 33+%

DOL-BLS
Today’s U.S. Workforce

What percent of workers have been with their company fewer than 5 years?
(a) 18%  (b) 29%  (c) 38%
(d) 50%  (e) 61%

d. 50%
Economy Defined by Greater Workplace Challenges and Dynamism

- Ohio State graduates will have 10-14 jobs by age 38!
- More than 1/3 of the entire US labor force changes jobs ANNUALLY.
- Half of workers have been with their company less than 5 years.
- Every year, more than 30 million Americans are working in jobs that did not exist in the previous year.

DOL-BLS
Key Capabilities Open the Door for Career Success and Earnings

“Irrespective of college major or institutional selectivity, what matters to career success is students’ development of a **broad set of cross-cutting capacities**…”

*Anthony Carnevale, Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce*
Narrow Learning is Not Enough: The Essential Learning Outcomes

★ Knowledge of Human Cultures and the Physical & Natural World
★ Intellectual and Practical Skills
★ Personal and Social Responsibility
★ “Deep” Integrative Learning
Deep, Integrative Learning

- Attend to the underlying meaning of information as well as content
- Integrate and synthesize different ideas, sources of information
- Discern patterns in evidence or phenomena
- Apply knowledge in different situations
- View issues from multiple perspectives
What the World Needs Now

1. College graduates ready to hit the ground running, with the knowledge, proficiencies, and dispositions to be economically self-sufficient, and socially, personally and civically responsible

2. An educated citizenry prepared for a lifetime of continuous learning, reflection, and self-mediated intellectual, vocational, and personal development
Early College Indicators of Persistence and Success

✓ Psycho-social fit
✓ Credit hours completed
✓ Academic and social support
✓ Goal realization
✓ Involvement in the “right” kinds of activities
What Really Matters in College?

**Student Engagement**

Because individual effort and involvement are the critical determinants of college impact, institutions should focus on the ways they can shape their academic, interpersonal, and extracurricular offerings to encourage student engagement.

Pascarella & Terenzini, 2005, p. 602
It Takes a Whole Campus to Educate a Student
Something Else That Really Matters in College

The greatest impact appears to stem from students’ **total level** of campus engagement, particularly when academic, interpersonal, and extracurricular involvements are **mutually reinforcing**…

Pascarella & Terenzini, 2005, p. 647
Grades, persistence, student satisfaction, gains across a range of desired outcomes, and engagement go hand in hand.
It’s more complicated than this…

- Many educational effects are “conditional”
- Some are compensatory
- Some have unusually positive effects – high-impact practices
High-Impact Activities

- First-Year Seminars and Experiences
- Common Intellectual Experiences
- Learning Communities
- Writing-Intensive Courses
- Collaborative Assignments and Projects
- Undergraduate Research and Other Demanding Inquiry Experiences
- Diversity/Global Learning
- Service Learning, Community-Based Learning
- Internships and Field Placements
- Capstone Courses and Projects
Why HIPs Matter

- Many of them require applied, hands-on, integrative learning
- They are associated with unusually positive effects on a variety of desired outcomes
- They have compensatory effects for students from historically underserved populations
AAC&U HIPs Resources

High-Impact Educational Practices

Five High-Impact Practices
AAC&U HIPs Resources

Ensuring Quality & Taking High-Impact Practices to Scale

Assessing Underserved Students’ Engagement in High-Impact Practices
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Helpfulness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>84%</td>
<td>Students complete a significant project before graduation that demonstrates their depth of knowledge in their major AND their acquisition of analytical, problem-solving, and communication skills (62% help a lot)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81%</td>
<td>Students complete an internship or community-based field project to connect classroom learning with real-world experiences (66%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81%</td>
<td>Students develop research skills appropriate to their field and develop evidence-based analyses (57%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73%</td>
<td>Students work through ethical issues and debates to form their own judgments (48%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recommendations

1. Put money where it makes a difference to student success.

*It’s not how much you spend but where* (DEEP study, Delta Cost Project, Cornell studies)
Occasional Paper #3

Connecting the Dots Between Learning and Resources

Jane V. Wellman

1. Intentionality matters as much or more than money alone

2. Spending on instruction and student services pays off in learning, persistence, and graduation

www.learningoutcomeassessment.org/OccasionalPapers.htm
Recommendations

2. Sunset redundant, less effective programs
Recommendations

3. Focus on implementation fidelity

“Everything depends upon equality of the experience.”

John Dewey,
Experience and Education
Recommendations

3. Focus on implementation fidelity

➢ *Start with the ends in mind:*

✓ the goals, form, and functions of the program, project or activity;
✓ student and staff desired behaviors
✓ intended outcomes
✓ evaluation and sustainability plan

➢ *Insist on doing what works*
Engaging Pedagogies

a. Classroom organization
b. Early and continuing assignments requiring reflection and integration coupled with feedback
c. Use of peer coaches/mentors
d. One minute papers (variations)
e. Case studies
f. Debates
g. Simulations
h. Small group problem sets
i. ePortfolios
j. Others…
Make Effective Practice Mandatory

- Create guided pathways to completion
  - Point students to programs, resources and activities that work!
- Require orientation and intrusive advising
  - Teach newcomers about the campus culture
  - Advise every student to do (at least) one high-quality “high-impact” experience early in their college experience.
Ponder This

- What high-impact practices (HIPs) – those identified by AAC&U and others -- are available at Ohio State?
- Which students do HIPs?
- Do students know about the HIPs available? How do they learn about them?
- How do you know your HIPs are effective? What is the evidence?
Features of Effective Learning Communities

- Students co-enrolled in two or more linked courses
- One course is writing- or inquiry-intensive or has service learning component
- Instructors collaborate/coordinate activities
- Assignments that require synthesis and integration of material from linked courses
- Instructional team includes peer preceptor who facilitates out-of-class activities
- Participants (students, peer mentor) live on campus in close proximity
- Instructor is LC students academic advisor for first year
Features of Effective Student-Faculty Research

- Faculty/staff member provides structure and feedback throughout
- Students participate in entire inquiry cycle
  - Identify problem to be investigated
  - Flesh out research questions
  - Help review related literature
  - Help design and assist with data collection
  - Help design and conduct data analysis
  - Help write up findings and implications
  - Present study/project to others
  - Co-author papers
Impact of High-Impact Activities Enhanced When Students:

- Strive to reach expectations set at appropriately high levels
- Invest time and effort
- Interact with faculty and peers about substantive matters
- Experience diversity
- Get more frequent feedback
- Reflect & integrate learning
- Discover relevance of learning through real-world applications
- Demonstrate competence publicly
Generating Interest

- Orientation staff and academic advisors— *how might they encourage students to participate in HIPs?*

- HIP offices (study abroad office, community service, res life, etc.)— *how and from where might they get extra support?*

- Underrepresented student programs— *how can HIPs reach more students?*

- Departments— *how to integrate HIPs into disciplines?*

- Faculty— *how can faculty get involved?*
Caveat

Not every faculty or staff member has to be directly involved in a HIP or other innovations
Make Effective Practice Mandatory

- Create guided pathways to completion
- Require orientation and intrusive advising
- Expand FIGs and theme-based housing
- Scale up learning communities
- Require math refresher before placement test
- Reduce D/W/F rates
- Deploy *effective* early warning systems
- Scale up Supplemental Instruction
- Communicate with students’ family members
- Use assessment approaches that measure and enrich desired outcomes (*ePortfolios*)
Recommendations

4. Infuse features of high-impact applied learning activities into more classrooms, labs, studios, and other learning settings

*Transform student employment at OSU into something akin to a HIP*
Supervisors had two structured conversations with every student employee during spring semester and coded conversations into the following categories:

- How the job and academics complement each other ("How is your job fitting in with your academics?")
- Transfer between work and academics ("What are you learning here at work that is helping you in school?")
- Transfer between academics and work ("Are you learning anything in class that you can apply here at work?")
- Transfer between work and future career ("Give me a couple of examples of things that you are learning here at work that you will be using in your future profession?")
U of Iowa Student Employment Project
“Guided Reflection on Work” (GROW)

- Student Employment Survey used to examine differences between pilot and non-pilot participants.
## Student Employment Outcomes: “Guided Reflection on Work” (GROW)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>% agree/strongly agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pilot Participants</strong></td>
<td><strong>Non-Pilot</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My supervisor helps me make connections between my work and my life as a student.</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job has helped prepare me for the world of full-time work.</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job has helped me improve my written communications.</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Student Employment Outcomes: “Guided Reflection on Work” (GROW)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>% agree/strongly agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pilot Participants</td>
<td>Non-Pilot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can see connections between my job and my major/coursework.</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job has helped me learn about career options.</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Student Employment Outcomes: “Guided Reflection on Work” (GROW)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>% agree/strongly agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pilot Participants</td>
<td>Non-Pilot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Because of my job, I am able to work effectively with individuals with a variety of backgrounds, experiences, and cultures.</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job has helped me use critical thinking skills</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recommendations

5. Measure and act on what matters to student success
Recommendations…

1. Put money where it makes difference to student success
2. Sunset redundant, less effective programs
3. Focus on implementation fidelity
4. Infuse the features of high-impact applied learning activities into more classrooms, labs, studios and other learning settings
5. Measure and act on what matters to student success
The things we have to learn before we do them, we learn by doing them.

Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*
Improvement-Oriented Ethos

- Self-correcting orientation
- Continually question, “Are we performing as well as we can?”
- Confident, responsive, but never quite satisfied…
- “We know who we are, what we aspire to, and are committed to achieving excellence”
- “And to realize our aspirations we need to work together effectively”
Healthy, respectful, developmentally powerful communities are based in large part on trust.
Meaningful Collaboration and Strategic Change: Move at the Speed of Trust
The Major Tasks

Teach students to:

- **Reflect** – think about their thinking and experiences in and out of the classroom, on and off the campus
- **Apply** – transfer and use what one has learned in different settings that present novel challenges and opportunities
- **Integrate** – connect and grasp the relevance of what they are learning from different courses, out-of-class experiences, and life beyond the institution
Questions & Discussion